

City of Welch West Virginia Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund

GASB 68 Actuarial Information for the Measurement Period Ending June 30, 2020

Bolton

Submitted by: James Ritchie, ASA, EA, FCA, MAAA Senior Consulting Actuary 443.573.3924 jritchie@boltonusa.com

Jordan McClane, FSA, EA, FCA, MAAA Actuary 667.218.6935 jmcclane@boltonusa.com



November 4, 2020

Ms. Robin Lee Finance Director City of Welch 88 Howard Street Welch, WV 24801 Deputy Timothy Vineyard Pension Board Secretary City of Welch Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund

Re: City of Welch Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund GASB 68 Actuarial Information for the Measurement Period Ending June 30, 2020

Dear Robin,

The following report contains the GASB 67 and GASB 68 actuarial information for the City of Welch Policemen's Pension and Relief Fund to be included in the City's financial statements for FY 2020. The GASB 67 information has been provided as of June 30, 2020 (the GASB 68 measurement date for FY 2020).

Methodology, Reliance and Certification

This report is prepared for the City. The report contains the actuarial information to be included with the City's financial statements for the year ending June 30, 2020 (the City's fiscal year end date) as required by GASB 68. This information has been prepared for use in the financial statements of the City. This information is not intended for, nor should it be used for, any additional purposes.

The total pension liability is based on the July 1, 2019 actuarial valuation rolled forward to June 30, 2020. The methods, assumptions, and participant data used are detailed in the July 1, 2019 actuarial valuation report with the exception of the actuarial cost method. These calculations are based on the Entry Age Normal cost method as required by GASB 67. The calculation of the Actuarially Determined Contribution for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2020 is contained in the July 1, 2018 actuarial valuation report. The discount rate assumption may have changed if a blended rate was used for GASB purposes.

The included calculations assume that the members and the City will continue to make all required contributions in accordance with the City's funding policy.

The long-term nominal expected rate of return on pension plan investments was determined using a methodology approved by the Municipal Pensions Oversight Board (MPOB) and is based on the fund's current funding ratio, liquidity ratio, equity exposure and expected funded status in 15 years.

These calculations and comparisons with assets are applicable for the valuation date only. The future is uncertain, and the plan may become better funded or more poorly funded in the future. This valuation does not provide any guarantee that the plan will be able to provide the promised benefits in the future.

Ms. Robin Lee November 4, 2020 Page 2

Methodology, Reliance and Certification (cont.)

This is a deterministic valuation in that it is based on a single set of assumptions. This set of assumptions is one possible basis for our calculations. Other assumptions may be equally valid. The future is uncertain and the plan's actual experience will differ from the assumptions; the differences may be significant or material because the results are very sensitive to the assumptions made and, in some cases, to the interaction between the assumptions. We may consider that some factors are not material to the valuation of the plan and may not provide a specific assumption for those factors. We may have used other assumptions in the past. We will likely consider changes in assumptions at a future date.

The City is responsible for selecting the plan's funding policy based on four methods allowed for under state law. The actuarial valuation methods are chosen by the actuary in accordance with actuarial standards of practice promulgated by the Actuarial Standards Board of the American Academy of Actuaries and as required by GASB 67 & 68. The MPOB selects the asset valuation methods and assumptions; these selections are reviewed by a qualified actuary no less than every five years. The actuarial process. The policies, methods and assumptions used in this valuation are those that have been so prescribed and are described in this report. The City and MPOB are solely responsible for communicating to Bolton Partners, Inc. any changes required thereto.

The City could reasonably ask how the valuation would change if we used a different assumption set or if plan experience exhibited variations from our assumptions. This report does not contain such an analysis. That type of analysis would be a separate assignment.

The cost of this plan is determined by the benefits promised by the plan, the plan's participant population, the investment experience of the plan and many other factors. An actuarial valuation is a budgeting tool for the City or, in this case, a measure of accounting expense. It does not affect the cost of the plan. As the experience of the plan evolves, it is normal for the level of contributions and expense of the plan to change.

We make every effort to ensure that our calculations are accurately performed. These calculations are complex. Despite our best efforts, we may make a mistake. We reserve the right to correct any potential errors by amending the results of this report or by including the corrections in a future valuation report.

Because modeling all aspects of a situation is not possible or practical, we may use summary information, estimates, or simplifications of calculations to facilitate the modeling of future events in an efficient and cost-effective manner. We may also exclude factors or data that are immaterial in our judgment. Use of such simplifying techniques does not, in our judgment, affect the reasonableness of valuation results for the plan.

This report is based on plan provisions, census data, and asset data submitted by the City. We have relied on this information for purposes of preparing this report, but have not performed an audit. The accuracy of the results presented in this report is dependent upon the accuracy and completeness of the underlying information. The plan sponsor is solely responsible for the validity and completeness of this information.

The valuation was completed using both proprietary and third-party models (including software and tools). We have tested these models to ensure they are used for their intended purposes, within their known limitations, and without any known material inconsistencies unless otherwise stated.



Ms. Robin Lee November 4, 2020 Page 3

Methodology, Reliance and Certification (cont.)

The City is solely responsible for selecting the plan's investment policies, asset allocations and individual investments. Bolton Partners, Inc.'s actuaries have not provided any investment advice to the City.

The information in this report was prepared for the internal use of the City, the plan and their auditors in connection with our actuarial valuations of the pension plan as required by GASB 68. This report may not be used for any other purpose; Bolton Partners, Inc. is not responsible for the consequences of any unauthorized use or the reliance on this information by any other party.

The calculation of actuarial liabilities for valuation purposes is based on a current estimate of future benefit payments. The calculation includes a computation of the "present value" of those estimated future benefit payments using an assumed discount rate; the higher the discount rate assumption, the lower the estimated liability will be. For purposes of estimating the liabilities (future and accrued) in this report, an assumption based on the expected long-term rate of return on plan investments is used. If the plan is expected to become insolvent, the return assumption is blended with a long-term municipal bond rate. Using a lower discount rate assumption, such as a rate solely based on long-term bond yields, could substantially increase the estimated present value of future and accrued liabilities.

This report provides certain financial calculations for use by the auditor. These values have been computed in accordance with our understanding of generally accepted actuarial principles and practices and fairly reflect the actuarial position of the Plan. The various actuarial assumptions and methods which have been used are, in our opinion, appropriate for the purposes of this report.

The report is conditioned on the assumption of an ongoing plan and is not meant to present the actuarial position of the plan in the case of plan termination. Future actuarial measurements may differ significantly from the current measurements presented in this report due to such factors as the following: plan experience differing from that anticipated by the economic or demographic assumptions, changes in economic or demographic assumptions, increases or decreases expected as part of the natural operation of the methodology used for these measurements (such as the end of an amortization period or additional cost or contribution requirements based on the plan's funded status), and changes in plan provisions or applicable law.

The undersigned enrolled actuaries meet the Qualification Standards of the American Academy of Actuaries to render the actuarial opinion contained herein. The July 1, 2019 actuarial valuation report contains information that is integral to the results contained herein and a copy may be provided upon request.

Sincerely,

Jams Ritchie

James Ritchie, ASA, EA, FCA, MAAA

ful Mide

Jordan McClane, FSA, EA, FCA, MAAA





Net Pension Liability of the Employer

The components of the net pension liability of the Employer at June 30, 2020, were as follows:

Total pension liability	\$ 2,516,912
Plan fiduciary net position	 (2,939,683)
Employer's net pension liability	\$ (422,771)
Plan fiduciary net position as a percentage of the total pension liability	116.80%

Actuarial assumptions. The total pension liability was determined by an actuarial valuation as of July 1, 2019 rolled forward to June 30, 2020 using the following actuarial assumptions, applied to all periods included in the measurement:

Inflation	2.75 percent
Salary increases	Rates vary by years of service
Single discount rate (BOY)	6.50%
Single discount rate (EOY)	6.50%
Investment rate of return (BOY)	6.50%, net of pension plan investment expense, including inflation
Investment rate of return (EOY)	6.50%, net of pension plan investment expense, including inflation
Long-term municpal bond rate (BOY)	3.13%
Long-term municpal bond rate (EOY)	2.45%
Mortality	RP-2014 Blue Collar Mortality Table with generational projection using Scale MP-2014
Year Fund is projected to be fully funded	N/A - over 100% funded on the 6/30/2020 measurement date
Year assets are expected to be depleted	N/A
for a closed plan	

The above is a summary of key actuarial assumptions. Full descriptions of the actuarial assumptions are available in the July 1, 2019 actuarial valuation report.

Sensitivity of the net pension liability to changes in the discount rate

	Decrease 5.50%	Current count Rate 6.50%	1%	6 Increase 7.50%
Employer's net pension liability	\$ (57,905)	\$ (422,771)	\$	(720,889)



Changes in the Net Pension Liability

	l tal Pension Liability (a)	Pla	ase (Decrease an Fiduciary et Position (b)	Ne	et Pension Liability (a) - (b)
Balances at 6/30/19	\$ 2,565,994	\$	2,952,715	\$	(386,721)
Changes for the year:					
Service cost	52,826				52,826
Interest	163,325				163,325
Changes of benefit terms	-				-
Differences between expected and actual experience	(158,631)				(158,631)
Changes of assumptions	-				-
Contributions - employer (including Premium Tax Allocation)			48,043		(48,043)
Contributions - member			12,774		(12,774)
Net investment income			32,753		(32,753)
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(106,602)		(106,602)		-
Administrative expense			-		-
Other			-		-
Net Changes	 (49,082)		(13,032)		(36,050)
Balances at 6/30/20	\$ 2,516,912	\$	2,939,683	\$	(422,771)
Return on Investments			1.1%		



Components of Employer's Pension Expense for the Fiscal Year Ended June 30, 2020

Note	Description	Amount
А	Service cost	\$ 52,826
В	Interest on the total pension liability	163,325
А	Changes of benefit terms	-
С	Differences between expected and actual experience	(55,879)
С	Changes of assumptions	19,132
А	Employee contributions	(12,774)
D	Projected earnings on pension plan investments	(190,437)
С	Differences between expected and actual earnings on	15,159
	plan investments	
А	Pension plan administrative expense	-
А	Other changes in fiduciary net position	-
	Total Pension Expense	\$ (8,648)

Notes:

- A Provided in the Changes in Net Pension Liability exhibit.
- B Based on the following calculation:

	A	Amount for Period (a)	Portion of Period (b)	Interest Rate (c)	E	rojected arnings x (b) x (c)
Beginning total pension liability	\$	2,565,994	100%	6.50%	\$	166,790
Service cost (End of Year)		52,826	0%	6.50%		-
Benefit payments, including refunds of employee contributions		(106,602)	50%	6.50%		(3,465)
Total interest on the total pension liability					\$	163,325

C Provided in the Schedules of Deferrals.

D Based on the following calculation:

	ļ	Amount for Period (a)	Portion of Period (b)	Projected Rate of Return (c)	E	rojected Earnings x (b) x (c)
Beginning plan fiduciary net position	\$	2,952,715	100%	6.50%	\$	191,926
Employer contributions		48,043	50%	6.50%		1,561
Employee contributions		12,774	50%	6.50%		415
Benefit payments, including refunds of employee contributions		(106,602)	50%	6.50%		(3,465)
Administrative expense and other		-	50%	6.50%		-
Total Projected Earnings					\$	190,437



Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Related to Pensions

At June 30, 2020, the Employer reported deferred outflows of resources and deferred inflows of resources related to pensions from the following sources:

	ed Outflows esources	Deferred Inflow of Resources				
Differences between expected and actual experience	\$ 55,636	\$	210,730			
Changes of assumptions	55,378		24,097			
Net difference between projected and actual earnings on pension plan investments	68,656		-			
Total	\$ 179,670	\$	234,827			

Amounts reported as deferred outflows of resources and deferred inflows of resources related to pensions will be recognized in pension expense as follows:

Year ended June 30:	
2021	\$ (31,682)
2022	(28,264)
2023	(32,895)
2024	37,684
2025	-
Thereafter	-

Changes in the Employer's Net Pension Liability and Related Ratios Last 10 Fiscal Years

Total pension liability	2020	2019	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014	2013		2012		2011
Service cost	\$ 52,826	\$ 69,234	\$ 73,730	\$ 73,696	\$ 59,141	\$ 77,674	\$ 79,083	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -
Interest	163,325	154,460	150,068	150,425	134,290	122,354	121,290		-		-	-
Changes of benefit terms	-	-	-	-	-	-	-		-		-	-
Differences between expected and actual experience	(158,631)	36,898	(150,665)	46,772	62,923	(101,196)	-		-		-	-
Changes of assumptions	-	-	-	-	239,703	(130,495)	-		-		-	-
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(106,602)	(141,794)	(96,944)	(61,008)	(121,747)	(52,496)	(32,632)		-		-	-
Net change in total pension liability	 (49,082)	 118,798	(23,811)	209,885	374,310	(84,159)	167,741		-		-	-
Total pension liability - beginning	2,565,994	2,447,196	2,471,007	2,261,122	1,886,812	1,970,971	1,803,230		-		-	-
Total pension liability - ending (a)	\$ 2,516,912	\$ 2,565,994	\$ 2,447,196	\$ 2,471,007	\$ 2,261,122	\$ 1,886,812	\$ 1,970,971	\$	-	\$	-	\$ -

Plan fiduciary net position	2020	2019	2018	2017		2016	2015		2014	2013		2012	2011
Contributions - employer (including Premium Tax Allocation)	\$ 48,043	\$ 57,392	\$ 62,078	\$ 58,637	\$	50,150	\$ 58,535	\$	120,070	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -
Contributions - member	12,774	14,283	16,783	18,345		18,496	20,028		14,703	-		-	-
Net investment income	32,753	233,740	213,645	187,834		110,263	64,962		226,663	-		-	-
Benefit payments, including refunds of member contributions	(106,602)	(141,794)	(96,944)	(61,008)		(121,747)	(52,496)		(32,632)	-		-	-
Administrative expense	-	-	-	-		-	-		(52)	-		-	-
Other	 -	-	-	-	_	-	-	_	-	 -	_	-	 -
Net change in plan fiduciary net position	\$ (13,032)	\$ 163,621	\$ 195,562	\$ 203,808	\$	57,162	\$ 91,029	\$	328,752	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -
Plan fiduciary net position - beginning	2,952,715	2,789,094	2,593,532	2,389,724		2,322,822	2,231,793		1,896,301	-		-	-
Plan fiduciary net position - ending (b)	\$ 2,939,683	\$ 2,952,715	\$ 2,789,094	\$ 2,593,532	\$	2,379,984	\$ 2,322,822	\$	2,225,053	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -
Employer's net pension liability - ending (a)-(b)	\$ (422,771)	\$ (386,721)	\$ (341,898)	\$ (122,525)	\$	(118,862)	\$ (436,010)	\$	(254,082)	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -
Plan fiduciary net position as a percentage of the total pension liability	116.80%	115.07%	113.97%	104.96%		105.26%	123.11%		112.86%	0.00%		0.00%	0.00%
Covered payroll	\$ 158,748	\$ 208,669	\$ 228,853	\$ 231,369	\$	246,669	\$ 277,419	\$	285,193	\$ -	\$	-	\$ -
Employer's net pension liability as a percentage of covered payroll	(266.32%)	(185.33%)	(149.40%)	(52.96%)		(48.19%)	(157.17%)		(89.09%)	0.00%		0.00%	0.00%
Expected average remaining service years of all participants	4.00	6.00	5.83	6.18		6.50	7.36		-	-		-	-

Notes to Schedule:

Benefit changes: There were no changes for FY2020.

Changes of assumptions: There were no changes for FY2020.

*Market value of assets as of July 1, 2016, includes \$9,740, excluded from the market value of assets as of June 30, 2016, used for the actuarial valuation report for the fiscal year end June 30, 2016.

*Market value of assets as of July 1, 2014, includes \$6,740, excluded from the market value of assets as of June 30, 2014, used for the actuarial valuation report for the fiscal year end June 30, 2014.

Schedule of Employer Contributions Last 10 Fiscal Years

	2020	2019	2018	2017	2016	2015	2014	2013	2012		2011
Actuarially determined contribution	\$ 52,363	\$ 57,599	\$ 50,047	\$ 42,067	\$ 3,877	\$ 51,539	\$ 83,853	\$ 79,284	\$ -	:	\$
Contributions in relation to the actuarially determined contribution											
Employer provided	48,043	57,392	62,078	58,637	50,150	58,535	68,815	54,007	-		-
State provided	-	-	-	-	-	-	51,255	157,176	-		-
Contribution deficiency (excess)	\$ 4,320	\$ 207	\$ (12,031)	\$ (16,570)	\$ (46,273)	\$ (6,996)	\$ (36,217)	\$ (131,899)	\$ -		÷ -
Covered payroll	\$ 158,748	\$ 208,669	\$ 228,853	\$ 231,369	\$ 146,669	\$ 277,419	\$ 285,193	\$ 301,123	\$ -	:	\$ -
Contributions as a percentage of covered employee payroll	30.26%	27.50%	27.13%	25.34%	34.19%	21.10%	42.10%	70.13%	N/#	A	N//

Notes to Schedule

Valuation date:

Actuarially determined contribution amounts are calculated as of the beginning of the fiscal year (July 1) for the year immediately following the fiscal year. Actuarial valuations are performed every year.

Methods and assumptions used to determine co	ontribution rates:
Actuarial cost method	Entry Age Normal
Amortization method	Level Dollar
Remaining amortization period	13 years
Asset valuation method	Market Value
Inflation	2.75 percent
Salary increases	Rates vary by years of service
Investment rate of return	6.50%, net of pension plan investment expense, including inflation
Retirement age	Rates vary by age
Mortality	RP-2014 Blue Collar Mortality Table with generational projection using Scale MP-2014

Schedule of Differences between Projected and Actual Earnings on Pension Plan Investments

In conformity with paragraph 33b of Statement 68, the effects of differences between projected and actual earnings on pension plan investments are recognized in pension expense using a systematic and rational method over a closed fiveyear period, beginning in the current reporting period. The following table illustrates the application of this requirement.

Year	Differences between Projected and Actual Earning on Pension Plan Investments		2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	20	21	2022	2023	2024
2016	\$ 50,476	5	\$ 10,095	10,095	10,095	10,095	10,096					
2017	(31,983	5		\$ (6,397)	(6,397)	(6,397)	(6,397)		(6,395)			
2018	(45,653	5			\$ (9,131)	(9,131)	(9,131)		(9,131)	(9,129)		
2019	(54,728	5				\$ (10,946)	(10,946)		(10,946)	(10,946)	(10,944)	
2020	157,684	5					\$ 31,537		31,537	31,537	31,537	31,53
let increa	se (decrease) in pensio	n expense					\$ 15,159	\$	5,065	\$ 11,462	\$ 20,593	\$ 31,53

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Arising from Differences between Projected and Actual Earnings on Pension Plan Investments

					Balan June 3	ces at 0, 2020	
Year	tment Earnings than Projected (a)	Investment Earnings Greater Than Projected (b)	Amounts Recognized in Pension Expense Through June 30, 2020 (c)	Oi R	Deferred utflows of esources (a) - (c)	in Re	Deferred flows of esources (b) - (c)
2016	\$ 50,476	\$ -	\$ 50,476	\$	-	\$	-
2017	-	31,983	25,588		-		6,395
2018	-	45,653	27,393		-		18,260
2019	-	54,728	21,892		-		32,836
2020	157,684	-	31,537		126,147		-
				\$	126,147	\$	57,491

B

In conformity with paragraph 33a of Statement 68, the effects of differences between expected and actual experience are recognized in pension expense, beginning in the current reporting period, using a systematic and rational method over a closed period equal to the average of the remaining service lives of all employees that are provided with pensions through the pension plan (active and inactive employees), determined as of the beginning of the measurement period. The following table illustrates the application of this requirement.

							Increas	e (Decrease) in P	ension I	Expense A	Arising	g from th	e Recognition	of Diffe	erences be	tween Expecte	ed and A	ctual Exp	perience				
Year	Differences between Expected and Actual Experience	Recognition Period (Years)	Prior	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	20	016	20)17	2018		2019	2020	20	24	2022	2023	2024	2025	Thereafter
Prior	Experience	(Tears)	FIIUI	2011	2012	2013	2014	2013	20	510	20	117	2010		2019	2020	20	<u> </u>	2022	- 2025	2024		Increance
																				-	-		
2011	-	-																					
2012	-	-																					
2013	-	-																					
2014	-	-																					
2015	(101,196)	7.358680						\$ (13,752)	(1	13,752)	(1	13,752)	(13,752)		(13,752)	(13,752)	(1	3,752)	(4,932				
2016	62,923	6.502126							\$	9,677		9,677	9,677		9,677	9,677		9,677	4,861				
2017	46,772	6.180026									\$	7,568	7,568		7,568	7,568		7,568	7,568	1,364			
2018	(150,665)	5.825297											\$ (25,864)		(25,864)	(25,864)	(2	5,864)	(25,864	(21,345)			
2019	36,898	6.000000												S	6,150	6,150		6,150	6,150	6,150	6.148		
2020	(158,631)	4.000000														\$ (39,658)		9,658)	(39,658				
	se (decrease) in pe															\$ (55,879)		5,879)	\$ (51,875		\$ 6,148	\$	- \$ -

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Arising from Differences between Expected and Actual Experience

Experience Losses Year (a)		Experience Gains (b)	Amounts Recognized in Pension Expense Through June 30, 2020 (c)		ces at 0, 2020 Deferred Inflows of Resources (b) - (c)		
Prior	\$-	\$ -	\$ -	\$-	\$-		
2011	-	-	-	-	-		
2012		-	-				
2013	-	-		-	-		
2014		-	-				
2015	-	101,196	82,512		18,684		
2016	62,923	-	48,385	14,538	-		
2017	46,772	-	30,272	16,500	-		
2018	-	150,665	77,592	-	73,073		
2019	36,898	-	12,300	24,598	-		
2020	-	158,631	39,658	-	118,973		
				\$ 55,636	\$ 210,730		

In conformity with paragraph 33a of Statement 68, the effects of changes of assumptions should be recognized in pension expense, beginning in the current reporting period, using a systematic and rational method over a closed period equal to the average of the remaining service lives of all employees that are provided with pensions through the pension plan (active and inactive employees), determined as of the beginning of the measurement period. The following table illustrates the application of this requirement.

								Increase	e (Decre	ease) in Pe	ension Expense	Arising from th	e Effects of Ch	anges of Assum	ptions					
Year	Changes of Assumptions	Recognition Period (Years)	Prior	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	20	016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	202	Thereafter
	Assumptions	(rears)	Prior	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	20	110	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	202	Therealter
Prior	\$ -	-																		•
2011	-	-																		
2012	-	-																		
2013	-	-																		
2014	-	-																		
2015	(130,495)	7.358680						\$ (17,733)	(17,733)	(17,733)	(17,733)	(17,733)	(17,733)	(17,733)	(6,364)				
2016	239,703	6.502126							\$	36,865	36,865	36,865	36,865	36,865	36,865	18,513				
2017	-	6.180026																		
2018	-	5.825297																		
2019	-	6.000000																		
2020	-	4.000000																		
Net increase	e (decrease) in pe	ension expense												\$ 19,132	\$ 19,132	\$ 12,149	\$ -	\$	- \$	- \$

Deferred Outflows of Resources and Deferred Inflows of Resources Arising from Changes of Assumptions

Year	Increases in the Total Pension Liability (a)	Decreases in the Total Pension Liability (b)	Amounts Recognized in Pension Expense Through June 30, 2020 (C)	Balan June 3 Deferred Outflows of Resources (a) - (c)	ices at 60, 2020 Deferred Inflows of Resources (b) - (c)		
Prior	\$ -	\$ -	\$-	\$ -	\$ -		
2011	-	-	-	-			
2012	-	-	-	-			
2013	-	-	-	-			
2014	-	-	-	-			
2015	-	130,495	106,398	-	24,09		
2016	239,703	-	184,325	55,378			
2017	-	-	-	-			
2018	-	-	-	-			
2019	-	-	-	-			
2020	-						